

PUBLISHED TEXTS

EXACT TEKS WORDING (FROM TEA)

*“recognize characteristics and structures of argumentative text by identifying the claim”**“compose argumentative texts, including opinion essays, using genre characteristics and craft”*

WHAT DOES THIS MEAN TO ME?

A counterclaim is what someone on the other side believes.

A rebuttal answers the counterclaim and shows why the writer’s claim is stronger.

Agreeing with part of the other side, then answering it, makes me sound fair.

THIS WEEK’S FOCUS

Counterclaim and Rebuttal

from “**The Book of the National Parks**” by Robert Sterling Yard (1919)

Yard quotes the other side first: a member of Congress says parks are just playgrounds. Then he answers: this view entirely misses the point. He agrees with part of it, then shows why parks are far more. This week we study how a counterclaim and rebuttal make an argument stronger.

This deck teaches **argumentative author craft and composition** across the five RPLD thinking levels:

NOTICE → CHOOSE → SHOW → OWN → DEFEND.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 1 of 11

SLIDE 1 OF 11 ·

Introduce the Mentor Text

 ~5 min

“ ” = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

“This week we study a published argumentative text and one craft move: counterclaim and rebuttal.”

▶ Show the cover. Read the exact TEKS wording aloud.

“Our mentor text is *The Book of the National Parks* by Robert Sterling Yard, from 1919.”

▶ Preview the five thinking levels: Notice, Choose, Show, Own, Defend.

PREP & MATERIALS: slide deck · “The Book of the National Parks” (Robert Sterling Yard, 1919) · tracking sheet · pencils

THE MENTOR TEXT

The Book of the National Parks · Sharp Eyes (test)

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

Ask what makes a text argumentative.

RAISE THE THINKING

Ask how this text differs from the fables and poems of earlier weeks.

Read the published text.

In 1919 some people asked why the country should spend money on national parks. Robert Sterling Yard answers them. Read it twice.

The Book of the National Parks (excerpt)

The idea still widely obtains that our national parks are principally playgrounds. A distinguished member of Congress recently asked: "Why make these appropriations? More people visited Rock Creek Park here in the city of Washington last Sunday afternoon than went to the Yosemite all last summer. The country has endless woods and mountains which cost the Treasury nothing."

This view entirely misses the point. The national parks are recreational, of course. So are state, county and city parks.

But the national parks are far more than recreational areas. They are the supreme examples. They are the gallery of masterpieces.

SOURCE · PUBLIC DOMAIN

Robert Sterling Yard, *The Book of the National Parks*, Charles Scribner's Sons, 1919 (public domain, Project Gutenberg #27513)

I CAN | I can read a published argumentative text and notice the author's craft move.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 2 of 11

SLIDE 2 OF 11 ·

Read the Published Text

 ~6 min

" " = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

"This is our published mentor text. Listen first, then we will read it together."

▶ Read the excerpt aloud twice. Define any hard words in passing.

"Listen for the craft move: counterclaim and rebuttal."

▶ Point to the source box. Explain that this text is real, published, and in the public domain.

"Now we will take turns reading. I read one sentence, then you read the next sentence. Keep your finger under each word."

▶ Take Turns Reading (Fluency). Model sentence 1 with expression, then pause. The student reads sentence 2 while tracking with a finger or pointer. Keep alternating to the end, and praise expression. Use the Grade 5 Fluency Feedback Guide for rate, accuracy, and prosody feedback. (ELPS 3(H), 3(A), 2(A))

ANSWER KEY: See slide.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

Ask students to retell the excerpt in one sentence.

COMMON MISCONCEPTION

Thinking old texts are hard to use. The craft move works in our writing today.

TODAY'S THINKING JOB

NOTICE

"I can notice a counterclaim and a rebuttal."

EXACT TEKS WORDING

"recognize characteristics and structures of argumentative text by identifying the claim"

"compose argumentative texts, including opinion essays, using genre characteristics and craft"

Notice the counterclaim and the rebuttal.

Find the other side's idea and the sentence that answers it.

Counterclaim: parks are **principally playgrounds**

Rebuttal: **This view entirely misses the point.**

I CAN | I can notice the counterclaim and the rebuttal.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts · Monday

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 3 of 11

SLIDE 3 OF 11 ·
Monday · NOTICE

~4 min

" " = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

"Today's job is NOTICE. Notice the counterclaim and the rebuttal."

▶ Find the other side's idea and the sentence that answers it.

"I can notice a counterclaim and a rebuttal."

▶ Students write on the NOTICE row of the tracking sheet, then share with a partner.

ANSWER KEY: Counterclaim: national parks are **principally playgrounds**. Rebuttal: **This view entirely misses the point.**

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

I can notice the counterclaim and the rebuttal.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

Foundational level. Accept any accurate pointing to the text.

TODAY'S THINKING JOB

CHOOSE

"I can choose the sentence that concedes a point."

EXACT TEKS WORDING

"recognize characteristics and structures of argumentative text by identifying the claim"

"compose argumentative texts, including opinion essays, using genre characteristics and craft"

Choose the fair move.

Which sentence shows Yard agreeing with part of the other side?

- A** This view entirely misses the point.
- B** They are the gallery of masterpieces.
- C** The national parks are recreational, of course.

I CAN | I can choose where the writer fairly agrees with part of the other side.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 • Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts • Tuesday

TEKS 5.9(E) • 5.12(C) • Published Texts & Mentor Texts • Grade 5 • Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 • slide 4 of 11

SLIDE 4 OF 11 •

Tuesday • CHOOSE

 ~4 min

" " = say word-for-word • ▶ = teacher direction

"Today's job is CHOOSE. Choose the fair move."

▶ Which sentence shows Yard agreeing with part of the other side?

"I can choose the sentence that concedes a point."

▶ Students write on the CHOOSE row of the tracking sheet, then share with a partner.

ANSWER KEY: C. of course shows Yard admits parks are for fun too, before he shows they are much more.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

I can choose where the writer fairly agrees with part of the other side.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

Developing level. Ask why the other choices are weaker.

TODAY'S THINKING JOB

SHOW

"I can show how a rebuttal turns the argument."

EXACT TEKS WORDING

"recognize characteristics and structures of argumentative text by identifying the claim"

"compose argumentative texts, including opinion essays, using genre characteristics and craft"

Show how the rebuttal turns.

Which word turns the argument from agreeing to answering?

recreational, of course ...
But the national parks are **far more** than recreational areas.

I CAN | I can show the word that turns a concession into a rebuttal.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 • Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts • Wednesday

TEKS 5.9(E) • 5.12(C) • Published Texts & Mentor Texts • Grade 5 • Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 • slide 5 of 11

SLIDE 5 OF 11 •

Wednesday • SHOW

🕒 ~4 min

" " = say word-for-word • ▶ = teacher direction

"Today's job is **SHOW**. Show how the rebuttal turns."

▶ Which word turns the argument from agreeing to answering?

"I can show how a rebuttal turns the argument."

▶ Students write on the **SHOW** row of the tracking sheet, then share with a partner.

ANSWER KEY: But turns the argument. Yard agrees parks are fun, **but** claims they are far more: the supreme examples, a gallery of masterpieces.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

I can show the word that turns a concession into a rebuttal.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

Independent level. Students explain how, not just what.

TODAY'S THINKING JOB

OWN

"I can write a counterclaim and rebuttal."

EXACT TEKS WORDING

"recognize characteristics and structures of argumentative text by identifying the claim"

"compose argumentative texts, including opinion essays, using genre characteristics and craft"

Own it. Try the craft move.

Write a counterclaim and a rebuttal about a school topic, such as recess or homework.

Some people say _____.
That is true, of course, _____.
But _____ is far more than _____.

I CAN | I can write a counterclaim, a concession, and a rebuttal.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts · Thursday

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 6 of 11

SLIDE 6 OF 11 ·

Thursday · OWN

 ~4 min

" " = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

"Today's job is OWN. Own it. Try the craft move."

▶ Write a counterclaim and a rebuttal about a school topic, such as recess or homework.

"I can write a counterclaim and rebuttal."

▶ Students write on the OWN row of the tracking sheet, then share with a partner.

ANSWER KEY: Answers vary. One example: **Some people say recess is just playtime. That is true, of course, since we play. But recess is far more than play: it is where we learn to solve problems with friends.**

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

I can write a counterclaim, a concession, and a rebuttal.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

Advanced level. Students try the move in their own words.

TODAY'S THINKING JOB

DEFEND

"I can defend why a writer quotes the other side."

EXACT TEKS WORDING

"recognize characteristics and structures of argumentative text by identifying the claim"

"compose argumentative texts, including opinion essays, using genre characteristics and craft"

Defend the author's choice.

Why does Yard quote the member of Congress word for word?

A real quote shows the other side fairly.
Then the rebuttal has a real target.

I CAN | I can defend why quoting the other side makes the rebuttal stronger.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts · Friday

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 7 of 11

SLIDE 7 OF 11 ·

Friday · DEFEND

 ~4 min

" " = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

"Today's job is DEFEND. Defend the author's choice."

▶ Why does Yard quote the member of Congress word for word?

"I can defend why a writer quotes the other side."

▶ Students write on the DEFEND row of the tracking sheet, then share with a partner.

ANSWER KEY: Quoting exactly shows Yard is fair and the argument is real. When he answers it, readers trust that he beat the real argument, not a weak version.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

I can defend why quoting the other side makes the rebuttal stronger.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

Reflective level. Students judge the author's choice with a because statement.

Write your own argument with a rebuttal.

Choose a claim. Quote or describe the other side, agree with part of it, then rebut it.

State the counterclaim fairly.
Agree with one part of it.
Turn with **But and give your rebuttal.**

I CAN | I can write an argument that answers the other side with a rebuttal.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 8 of 11

SLIDE 8 OF 11 ·

YOUR TURN

 ~6 min

“ ” = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

“Write your own argument with a rebuttal.”

▶ Choose a claim. Quote or describe the other side, agree with part of it, then rebut it.

“Use the craft move from our mentor text.”

▶ Circulate. Confer with two or three writers and name the move you see.

ANSWER KEY: Answers vary. Check for a counterclaim, a concession, a turning word, and a rebuttal with a reason.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

Scan drafts for the craft move.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

Independent practice. Students write on the back of the tracking sheet.

Answers, across the five thinking levels.

NOTICE Counterclaim: national parks are **principally playgrounds**. Rebuttal: **This view entirely misses the point.**

CHOOSE **C. of course** shows Yard admits parks are for fun too, before he shows they are much more.

SHOW **But** turns the argument. Yard agrees parks are fun, **but** claims they are far more: the supreme examples, a gallery of masterpieces.

OWN Answers vary. One example: **Some people say recess is just playtime. That is true, of course, since we play. But recess is far more than play: it is where we learn to solve problems with friends.**

DEFEND Quoting exactly shows Yard is fair and the argument is real. When he answers it, readers trust that he beat the real argument, not a weak version.

YOUR TURN Answers vary. Check for a counterclaim, a concession, a turning word, and a rebuttal with a reason.

SLIDE 9 OF 11 ·

Review the Answers

 ~4 min

“ ” = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

“**Let’s check our work across all five thinking levels.**”

▶ *Reveal the answers one row at a time.*

“**If you missed one, that is your learning for today.**”

▶ *Celebrate strong explanations, not only correct answers.*

ANSWER KEY: See slide.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

Ask a student to explain one answer in their own words.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

OWN turns into DEFEND when students explain their choices.

READ THIS PASSAGE EXCERPT · FROM “SHARP EYES” (JOHN BURROUGHS, 1886)

“Whenever you have learned to discriminate the birds, or the plants, or the geological features of a country, it is as if new and keener eyes were added.”

According to the author, what happens when you learn to tell birds or plants apart?

- A** You stop noticing nature.
- B** Your real eyes change color.
- C** You need a telescope.
- D** It is as if new and keener eyes were added.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 10 of 11

SLIDE 10 OF 11 ·

Show What You Know

 ~4 min

“ ” = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

“Here is a test-style question on a passage from Sharp Eyes.”

▶ Read the passage and the question aloud.

“Read all four choices before you decide.”

▶ Students choose privately, then bubble the answer on the back of the tracking sheet.

ANSWER KEY: D.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

Ask students to find the words in the passage that prove their answer.

RPLD EVIDENCE & ADVICE

DEFEND in action.

The answer is D.

- A You stop noticing nature.**
He says the opposite: you notice more.
- B Your real eyes change color.**
He means a new way of seeing, not real eyes.
- C You need a telescope.**
He does not mention a telescope here.
- D It is as if new and keener eyes were added.**
Correct.
He writes that it is as if new and keener eyes were added.

The Writing Academy®, LLC

Grade 5 · Informational and Argumentative Mentor Texts

TEKS 5.9(E) · 5.12(C) · Published Texts & Mentor Texts · Grade 5 · Argumentative Mentor Text 3 of 4 · slide 11 of 11

SLIDE 11 OF 11 ·

The Answer, and Why

 ~4 min

“ ” = say word-for-word · ▶ = teacher direction

“The answer is D.”

▶ Reveal why each wrong choice does not match the passage.

“Each wrong choice does not match the words in the passage.”

▶ Students write one sentence explaining why the answer is correct.

ANSWER KEY: See slide.

CHECK FOR UNDERSTANDING

Explain why D fits the passage.

RAISE THE THINKING

Write a new question about the passage for a partner.